

Evaluation of Widyaiswara Professional Development Implementation: Study on the Ministry of Village, Development of Disadvantaged, and Transmigration

Sri Ratna¹, Muchlis R. Luddin¹, and Wibowo²

¹Universitas Negeri Jakarta, Jakarta –Indonesia

²Universitas Prof.Dr. Moestopo (Beragama)

Keywords: Widyaiswara Competencies, Profesional Development, Scientific Publication

Abstract: Professional development is one of the elements required for Widyaiswara who will rise to a higher level. This study aims to evaluate the Widyaiswara to find out the factors related to professional development, especially factors that cause the promotion and advancement to be hampered. The target is Widyaiswara that works at the Ministry of Village, Development of Disadvantaged Region and Transmigration. The evaluation results found that there were Widyaiswara who failed to rise in rank or position because they had not succeeded in collecting credit numbers from the elements of professional development activities. This study uses an evaluative approach, with documentation study data collection methods, in-depth interviews and observations, which are then analyzed using qualitative data analysis techniques that describe the results of implementation paired with concepts and theories based on critical thinking to find the causes of problems and the best alternative solutions. From the results of the study, it was recommended to Widyaiswara to be committed to improving competence and developing innovation in professional development. The ASN Employee Training Center is recommended to provide facilities and infrastructure specifically for the publication of scientific papers for Widyaiswara.

1 INTRODUCTION

Facing increasing challenges and strategic environments both internally and externally that experience changes very quickly and are difficult to predict, and the development of information technology is very fast nowadays, an organization will be able to survive and develop if it has quality human resources. Even though we have abundant natural resources but human resources that manage these natural resources are incompetent, we will lose in competition. Therefore, improving the quality of human resources is absolutely necessary. Likewise with ASN resources, which plays a decisive role in managing this country and nation absolutely needs to be improved.

The mandate of Law No. 5 of 2014 concerning the Civil Servants in its consideration suggests that it is necessary to build the Civil Servants (ASN) that has integrity, is professional, neutral and free from

political intervention, clean from the practices of corruption, collusion and nepotism, and able to provide public services to the public and able to play a role as an adhesive element of national unity and integrity based on Pancasila and the 1945 Constitution (Undang-Undang Nomor 5 Tahun 2014 tentang Aparatur Sipil Negara, 2014). To achieve SCA as stated above, the efforts that can be made include the development of competencies as contained in article 70 beginning in paragraphs 1 to 6, namely through education and training, seminars, courses, and upgrading (Peraturan Pemerintah Nomor 11 Tahun 2017 tentang Manajemen Pegawai Negeri Sipil, 2017). In addition to being regulated in Law No. 5 above, the development of this competency is further regulated in article 162, Government Regulation No. 11 of 2017 concerning Management of Civil Servants and more detailed elaboration is stated in the third part from articles 203 to 225.

One strategic effort to develop ASN competencies as stated in the consideration of the aforementioned Law is through education and training (Sikula, 2011). The objectives of developing ASN competencies will be achieved effectively, efficiently and accountably, if the training and training is carried out in a competency-based system. In its implementation, various factors influence, such as the process of managing training and the availability and quality of training resources. In addition, the availability and quality of education and training facilities and education and training materials which also greatly determine the achievement of training objectives are the availability and competency of education and training staff. The education staff includes managers of training institutions, training organizers, training needs analysts, training curriculum designers, managers of education and training information systems and Widyaiswara (Peraturan Kepala LAN Nomor 25 Tahun 2015 tentang Pedoman Akreditasi Lembaga Diklat, 2015). In this study, what will be discussed is only one of the education staff, namely the Widyaiswara.

Widyaiswara are Civil Servants (PNS) who are appointed as functional officials with duties, responsibilities, authority and rights to carry out education, teaching and training activities for civil servants, evaluation and development of training in government training institutions (Peraturan Menteri PAN dan RB Nomor 22 Tahun 2014 tentang Jabatan Fungsional Widyaiswara dan Angka Kreditnya, 2014). To be able to carry out all the tasks, responsibilities, authorities and rights, Widyaiswara is required to have various competencies, namely competence in the management of learning, substantive competence, social competence and personality competencies (Peraturan Kepala LAN RI Nomor 5 Tahun 2008 tentang Standar Kompetensi Widyaiswara, 2008). As a functional official, his achievements are judged by the acquisition of credit numbers from the elements of activities which consist of the main elements and supporting elements. The main elements consist of sub-elements of education, implementation of education, teaching and training of civil servants (PNS), evaluation and development of training and professional development.

Based on data from the Widyaiswara Ministry of Village PDT and Transmigration credit figures in the first semester of 2018, out of eight Widyaiswara who submitted credit numbers, there were two Widyaiswara who had not succeeded in advancing their ranks or positions, because they did not meet the minimum credit score figures from the development activities profession, three people have not yet obtained credit figures from professional

development and only three Widyaiswara have succeeded in obtaining credit figures from professional development (Kementerian Desa, PDT dan Transmigrasi, 2018). That's why the focus of the study was the Evaluation of Widyaiswara Professional Development Competence. By conducting this study, it is expected that the causes of not yet optimal implementation of the Widyaiswara professional development activities will be known, so that it is expected to find the right solution to overcome them.

The selection of the focus of this discussion is also expected to be useful in motivating Widyaiswara to carry out professional development, especially scientific publications for Widyaiswara Madya who will advance to the Widyaiswara Utama, because this scientific publication is a scientific speech requirement to the main level. In addition, with this scientific publication, Widyaiswara also contributes to the achievement of government program targets launched by Ministry of Research, Technology and Higher Education, which in 2019 Indonesia will become the leader in ASEAN and catch up with other countries by increasing the number scientific publication (Zuhriyah, 2018). Now Indonesia's position is still below Malaysia and has surpassed Singapore and surpassed Thailand after 20 years below it. Ministry of Research, Technology, and Higher Education is optimistic that it can exceed the number of Malaysian international publications which are now in the first position in ASEAN. Ministry of Research, Technology, and Higher Education also said that scientific publication is an absolute condition for making an innovation and all of that comes from a study or research (Direktorat Jenderal Penguatan Riset dan Pengembangan, 2018). With the amount of published research, it is hoped that it can be developed into an innovation that is useful to spur the industrial productivity of the community. The aim is to increase the nation's competitiveness. Widyaiswara who have a strategic role in developing ASN competencies are of course expected to contribute to scientific publications in the field of HR development.

2 THEORETICAL FRAMEWORK

2.1 Scientific Publication

Scientific publication is a publication system based on peer review in order to achieve the highest possible level of objectivity (Wikipedia Indonesia, 2017). This publication is an effort to disseminate the work of thought by researchers, academics, lecturers, students, and functional officials in general

including Widyaiswara, who come from the results of research or critical thinking or deep reflection. Publications can be carried out in various forms such as seminars, publications, journals and other types that allow these results to be known to the public to be useful and contribute to the development of science. The types of publications that can be accepted as contributions to the field of science vary greatly. At present it is undergoing very rapid changes, arising from the transition from the print publishing format to the electronic format, which has a different model from the previous pattern. Current general trend, access to electronically scientific journals is provided openly. This means that more scientific publications can be accessed for free through the internet, both those provided by the journal publishers, and those provided by the authors of the journal articles themselves.

Publication of scientific work is an important agenda for academics and functional positions, besides being a prerequisite for office, it is also expected that this will be done for the future of the Indonesian nation to be more advanced, because scientific publications are also an indicator of the nation's progress and competitiveness. If the results of research, studies and scientific works are only stored in the library, only limited circles are interested in reading them. Especially with a thick page, so people will be lazy to read it. Therefore, scientific publications that will make the results of the study useful. The benefits of publishing scientific papers include 1). Become a reference for further research; 2). contribute to solving a problem that does not yet have a solution; 3). With scientific publications, the originator will be known to the public and can build a network that is quite extensive and obtain copyright; 4). With so many publications, it can add to and enrich our knowledge; 5). Fulfillment of credit number requirements for positions that need it, especially for functional positions (Jurnal Prodikasi, 2016).

The process of scientific publications for each type of publication needs different requirements. Depending on the type of article, media publication and classification of journals. Each journal has its own rules and conditions. For Widyaiswara, in particular the guidelines for scientific writing have been regulated in the Head of State Administration Agency regulation number 9 of 2008. In general, the guidelines contain chapter 1: Introduction, including Background, Objectives, Objectives, Understanding and Systematics. Chapter 2 Forms and Requirements of Scientific Writing contains Scientific Writing in the Form of Books and Scientific Writing in the Form of Non-Books. Chapter 3 Rules, Procedures, and Systematics for Writing Scientific Writing includes the Rules of Writing, Procedures for

Writing, and Systematics of Writing and the Closing chapter (Peraturan Kepala LAN Nomor 9 Tahun 2008 tentang Penulisan Karya Tulis Ilmiah, 2008).

2.2 Professional Development

Ministry of Administrative and Bureaucratic Reform Regulations Number 22 of 2014 concerning Functional Position and Credit Numbers of Widyaiswara, among others, govern the Elements, Sub-Elements of Activities and Activity Details. The element of activity consists of the main elements and supporting elements. The main elements include 4 sub-elements, namely sub-elements 1). Education; 2). implementation of education, teaching and training; 3). evaluation and development of training; and 4). professional development. While the supporting elements are activities that support the implementation of the main tasks of Widyaiswara. Each sub-element is translated into the details of the activity. For the Sub-elements of Professional Development, the details of the activities are 1). Writing / Scientific Work in the field of expertise and scope of education; 2). The invention of patented innovation and has entered the list of patents according to the field of specialization of expertise; 3). Preparation of guidebooks, implementation provisions / technical provisions in the field of education. While activities in the supporting elements include 1). participation in seminars / workshops / conferences in the field of education; 2). membership in professional organizations; 3). Guidance to Widyaiswara under his level of office; 4). writing articles in newspapers; 5). writing articles on the Website; 6). the acquisition of another degree / diploma; and 7). award / merit.

In article 11 Ministry of Empowerment of State Apparatus and Bureaucracy Reform Regulations number 22 year 2014 regulates that for Widyaiswara who will rise in rank are required to obtain a minimum credit number from the details of the activities of the sub-elements of professional development as follows: Young Administrator (class III/b) who will become Administrator (class III/c), the credit number required at least 6 (six) comes from the sub-elements of professional development activities. And so on, for Administrator (class III/c) who will rise to Administrator level I (class III/d), at least get 8 (eight); for class III/d who will go up to Coach (class IV/a), at least 10 (ten); from class IV/a to Coach level I (class IV/b) is required a minimum of 12 (twelve), from class IV/b to the Young Main Coach (class IV/c) is required to be at least 14 (fourteen); for class IV/c which will rise to the Middle Main Coach (class IV/d), a minimum of 16 (sixteen) is required and for the Middle Main Coach

who will rise to the Main Coach (class IV/e) is required at least 18 (eighteen).

2.3 Widyaiswara Competence

In general, ASN competencies have been determined in consideration of Law number 5 of 2014, namely 1). have integrity and morality, 2). professional, 3). neutral and free from political intervention, 4). clean from the practices of corruption, collusion and nepotism, 5). able to provide public services for the community and 6). able to play a role as an adhesive element of national unity and integrity based on the Pancasila and the Constitution of the Republic of Indonesia. These competencies are categorized into a). technical competencies measured by the level and specialization of education, functional technical training, and experience working technically; b). managerial competencies measured from the level of education, structural or management training, and leadership experience; and c). Cultural social competencies measured by work experience relate to plural societies in terms of religion, ethnicity, and culture so that they have national insight.

In addition to the general competence that each ASN should have, each position also requires specific competencies / field competencies. Likewise with the lecturer, establishes four specific competencies / competencies in the fields: 1). Learning; namely the ability to plan, organize, implement, and evaluate learning; 2). Substantive; ability in the field of science and skills in the subject of training taught; 3). Personality; behavior in carrying out his job duties that can be observed and made an example for training participants; 4). Social; Ability to make connections with his work environment.

3 RESEARCH METHODOLOGY

This study aims to obtain valid, reliable data, facts and information about the implementation of the professional development of Widyaiswara functional officials at the Ministry of Village, Development of Disadvantaged Region and Transmigration. The approach used in this study is a qualitative research approach, namely a study aimed at describing and analyzing phenomena, events, social activities, attitudes, beliefs, perceptions, thoughts of individuals individually or in groups. Qualitative research is inductive: researchers allow problems to emerge from data or be left open to interpretation. Data is collected by careful observation, including descriptions in detailed contexts accompanied by notes on in-depth interviews, as well as the results of

analysis of documents and records (Sukmadinata, 2011).

In this study, the discussion focused on policies or regulations issued by the Ministry of Administrative and Bureaucratic Reform, the Republic of Indonesia State Administration Institute as a fostering institution for Widyaiswara functional positions and the Ministry of Village, Development of Disadvantaged Region and Transmigration, as well as other institutions related to the implementation of Widyaiswara professional development.

This study specifically aims to evaluate the implementation of Widyaiswara professional development related to 1). Professional development policy, 2). Widyaiswara competencies in professional development 3) Factors that influence the implementation of professional development, and 4). Obtaining credit numbers from professional development. Therefore, the benefits of this study are 1) Knowing the suitability of the Widyaiswara professional development policy with what should be; 2). Knowing the competence of Widyaiswara in professional development at the Ministry of Village, Development of Disadvantaged Region and Transmigration; 3). Knowing the factors that influence the effectiveness of the implementation of Widyaiswara professional development; 4). Knowing the acquisition of Widyaiswara credit numbers from the sub-elements of professional development.

This study uses an evaluative approach, with documentation study data collection methods, in-depth interviews and observations, which are then analyzed using qualitative data analysis techniques that describe the results of implementation paired with concepts and theories based on critical thinking to find the causes of problems and the best alternative solutions (Amstrong, 2009). The documents used are related to policies and performance reports as well as the results of credit score figures. In-depth interviews were conducted with the Head of the ASN Employee Training Center, Administrators and Widyaiswara from the Ministry of Village, Development of Disadvantaged Region and Transmigration. In addition, in-depth interviews were also conducted to the Head of the Indonesian Widyaiswara Development Center and Administrator officials in charge of credit score assessment. The reason for using this approach is because of its comprehensive nature, starting from the policy to the results of the policy.

4 RESULT AND DISCUSSION

Based on the description of the data obtained in the collection of data and paired with the rules, regulations and applicable policies regarding professional development, the results of the evaluation are as follows:

Widyaiswara professional development policy; This policy is intended to increase the professionalism of Widyaiswara. Professional development is expected to encourage Widyaiswara to enrich their insights and deepen their mastery of the field of study they pursue in stabilizing their specialties. As stated above, that one sub-element of the main activity is professional development, with details of activity 1). Writing / Scientific Work in the field of expertise and scope of education; 2). The invention of patented innovation and has entered the list of patents according to the field of specialization; 3). Preparation of guidebooks, implementation provisions / technical provisions in the field of education. All details of these activities are indicators of Widyaiswara's professionalism and at the same time become a medium or means of communication for Widyaiswara in expressing their ideas and knowledge in order to develop teaching materials and ensure the effectiveness of the learning process. Taking into account the policies and objectives of professional development when compared with other functional officials in Indonesia, the policy of professional development for Widyaiswara is still much younger. For example, for functional positions, researchers and lecturers who will rise to higher positions must carry out scientific publications in nationally or internationally reputed indexed journals. But for the Widyaiswara, the application of new publications will be imposed on the middle level Widyaiswara who will rise to the main level. And enough publications in national journals. And this publication will later be used as material for scientific speech when the inauguration becomes the Main Widyaiswara. With this policy, the quality of publications is not guaranteed.

Widyaiswara competence in professional development

The Widyaiswara competency standard stipulated through Head of State Administration Agency Regulation number 5 of 2008 has 4 (four) 1). Learning Management Competencies; namely the ability to plan, organize, implement, and evaluate learning, including the ability to make the Outlines of Learning Programs or Design and Build Learning Teaching and Learning Unit Events or Learning

Plans; compile teaching materials; applying adult learning; communicate effectively with participants; motivate participants to learn; and evaluate learning. 2). Substantive Competence; namely the ability in the field of science and skills in the subject of training taught, including the ability: mastery of science and skills to practice in accordance with the training material taught; and write scientific papers related to the scope of education and / or development of his specialty. 3). Personality Competence; behavior in carrying out his job duties which can be observed and made an example for training participants, including the ability: to display an exemplary person; and implementing a code of ethics and showing a work ethic as a professional Widyaiswara. 4). Social Competence; Ability to conduct relations with the work environment, including the ability: fostering relationships and cooperation with fellow Widyaiswara; and establish relationships with organizers / managers of Training institutions

In Law number 4 of 2014 in general, the competency of an ASN is also established, namely having integrity and morality, professional, neutral and free from political intervention, clean from corruption, collusion, nepotism, practices, able to provide public services for the community, capable of carrying out roles as an adhesive element of national unity based on the Pancasila and the Constitution of the Republic of Indonesia. Then these competencies are summarized into 3 (three) as follows: a). technical competencies measured by the level and specialization of education, functional technical training, and experience working technically; b). managerial competencies measured from the level of education, structural or management training, and leadership experience; and c). cultural social competencies that is measured by work experience is related to plural societies in terms of religion, ethnicity and culture so that they have national insight. If traced from all that is written into competency standards, which competencies will support professional development? Only listed in substantive competencies and mentioned writing scientific papers related to the scope of education and / or development of his specialty.

When compared with other functional positions that are required to write scientific papers, there are several competencies that ideally should be owned by Widyaiswara in order to be able to carry out sub-elements of professional development activities optimally. For researchers, the competency standards contained in Head Regulation of

Indonesian Institute of Sciences number 4 / E / 2009 and may be needed by Widyaiswara for professional development include: mastering library search techniques, data processing, scientific writing, research planning and mastering book writing techniques (Peraturan Kepala LIPI Nomor 4/E Tahun 2009 tentang Standar Kompetensi Peneliti, 2009). In addition, creative and innovative thinking skills are needed by Widyaiswara for the discovery of innovation in education.

Factors Affecting the Implementation of Professional Development

Many factors influence the implementation of Widyaiswara's professional development, namely, among others: 1). Professional development policy, 2). Work facilities and infrastructure, 3). Availability of budget for conducting research and the most decisive is 4). The relevant Widyaiswara him/herself. Regarding policy, as stated above, each Widyaiswara who will be promoted is required to collect credit numbers with a certain amount, for example for Primary Widyaiswara with class III/b Young Administrator who will be promoted to level I class III/c must collect credit number 6 (six). The existence of this policy encourages Widyaiswara to collect credit numbers, which means this has a positive effect. The next is work facility. Actually this work facility does not specifically affect the implementation of professional development, but it affects the overall performance of the Widyaiswara. But the limitations of infrastructure have an effect on the implementation of professional development for Widyaiswara. For example, the Widyaiswara has conducted research or studies and lives in publications, it turns out that in the ASN Employee Education Center there has been no official media or infrastructure for the publication of official printed and online scientific papers for the acquisition of credit numbers. This affects the motivation and productivity of Widyaiswara in carrying out professional development. Because of this limitation, Widyaiswara was forced to look for infrastructure outside, even having to pay for scientific publications. The implementation of research to produce scientific work of course requires a budget, but in reality it is not available. Because it affects or inhibits conducting research, although there are also Widyaiswara who are forced to finance their own research to produce scientific work. And the most influential in implementing professional development is the Widyaiswara him/herself. And this is related to motivation, competence and commitment to professional

development. Motivation can be both internal and external, and should be emerged from internal to last long. Likewise with widyaiswara competencies is a very decisive factor. And the most decisive is the commitment of yourself.

Achieved Credit Numbers from Professional Development

The credit numbers obtained are proof of the performance of the Widyaiswara's performance. In terms of obtaining credit numbers from professional development, most are hampered. Assessment of the last period, semester I of 2018, there were 8 people who submitted a list of proposed credit numbers. Of the 8 people who submitted only 5 people who got grades from professional development and 2 of the 5 people should have been promoted because the number of credit numbers had exceeded the target, but because the minimum requirements for professional development had not been fulfilled, those concerned had not yet qualified for promotion. While 3 people did not submit credit numbers from professional development. The acquisition of credit numbers is also very much related to scientific publications. Published papers will obtain a higher credit score compared to those presented among themselves. The results of interviews with the Widyaiswara, because the writing is often rejected, the person concerned person apathetic to send it back to the journal. This is an indicator that the quality of writing that is rejected is definitely not in accordance with what is required.

5 CONCLUSIONS

Based on the objectives and results of the evaluation and the discussion above, the following points can be summarized: 1). Professional development policies that are requirements for promotion can motivate Widyaiswara to obtain credit numbers from the sub-elements of this activity, although not all Widyaiswara have obtained them. Even if compared to other functional positions in Indonesia, such as researchers and lecturers, the policy for Widyaiswara for scientific publications is still very easy. What is required for scientific publications, only Middle Level Widyaiswara who will rise to the main level or the main level which is a transition from the High Leadership Position and even then nationally accredited or published by the State Administration Agency even though not yet accredited. In the provisions also requested international indexed publications, but the fact

remains, that several which has been published can still be counted on by the fingers; 2). The competency standards set for Widyaiswara, do not include the competencies needed for the implementation of professional development. The standards needed for professional development include mastering library search techniques, data processing, scientific writing, research planning and mastering book writing techniques. In addition, creative and innovative thinking skills are needed by Widyaiswara for the discovery of innovation in education. But the most decisive is the determination and commitment to learn in order to increase professionalism; 3). For factors that influence the implementation of professional development there are several, among others are professional development policies, work facilities and infrastructure, availability of budget for research and the most decisive are motivation, behavior attitude and determination of the relevant Widyaiswara him/herself to advance. These factors have a positive effect which encourages Widyaiswara to carry out professional development (because this is mandatory) and there are also negative influences such as the unavailability of research budgets, work facilities and infrastructure. 4). The acquisition of Widyaiswara credit figures from professional development is still very low. Of the 16 Widyaiswara from the Ministry of Village, Development of Disadvantaged Region and Transmigration, there are 8 people who proposed the determination of the credit figure. Of the 8 people who applied for professional development only 5 people and 2 out of those 5 should have been promoted but were blocked from acquisition of credit numbers sub elements of professional development

Based on the conclusions above, it is recommended as follows: 1). To the State Administration Agency to review professional development policies, because existing policies are not challenging enough to increase the professionalism of today's Widyaiswara, especially in scientific publications. In addition, it is also recommended to review competency standards especially those related to professional development; 2). To the ASN Employee Training Center, the Ministry of Village, Development of Disadvantaged Regions and Transmigration to be able to provide research budgets for each of the Widyaiswara and work facilities and infrastructure, especially scientific publication media. 3). To Widyaiswara to be committed to improving competence and professionalism, especially the development of

competencies in research, scientific writing and scientific publications. Because if you do not want or are not motivated in self-development or development of this profession, then the Widyaiswara will be crushed in this era of change which is full of challenges and competition.

REFERENCES

- Amstrong, M. (2009). Dalam B. P. Priyadi, *Metode Evaluasi Kualitatif*. Yogyakarta: Pustaka Pelajar.
- Direktorat Jenderal Penguatan Riset dan Pengembangan. (2018 , April 12). Salip Singapura, *Publikasi Ilmiah Indonesia Peringkat 2 ASEAN*. Diambil kembali dari Kementerian Riset, Teknologi dan Pendidikan Tinggi RI: <https://risbang.ristekdikti.go.id/publikasi/%20berita-media%20/salip-singapura-publikasi-ilmiah-indonesia-peringkat-2-asean/>
- Jurnal Prodikasi. (2016, November 15). Tiga Manfaat/Keuntungan Utama Menulis dan Publikasi Karya Tulis di Jurnal Ilmiah. Diambil kembali dari prodikasi.blogspot.com: <http://prodikasi.blogspot.com/2016/11/tiga-manfaat-keuntungan-utama-menulis.html>
- Kementerian Desa, PDT dan Transmigrasi. (2018). Hasil Penilaian Angka Kredit Widyaiswara. Jakarta: Pusdiklat Pegawai ASN.
- Peraturan Kepala LAN Nomor 25 Tahun 2015 tentang Pedoman Akreditasi Lembaga Diklat. (2015).
- Peraturan Kepala LAN Nomor 8 Tahun 2005 tentang Standar Kompetensi Widyaiswara. (2008).
- Peraturan Kepala LAN Nomor 9 Tahun 2008 tentang Penulisan Karya Tulis Ilmiah. (2008).
- Peraturan Kepala LAN RI Nomor 5 Tahun 2008 tentang Standar Kompetensi Widyaiswara. (2008).
- Peraturan Kepala LIPI Nomor 4/E Tahun 2009 tentang Standar Kompetensi Peneliti. (2009).
- Peraturan Menteri PAN dan RB Nomor 22 Tahun 2014 tentang Jabatan Fungsional Widyaiswara dan Angka Kreditnya. (2014).
- Peraturan Pemerintah Nomor 11 Tahun 2017 tentang Manajemen Pegawai Negeri Sipil. (2017).
- Sikula, A. E. (2011). *Manajemen Sumber Daya Manusia*. Bandung: Erlangga.
- Sukmadinata, N. S. (2011). *Metode Penelitian Pendidikan*. Bandung: PT Remaja Rosdakarya.
- Undang-Undang Nomor 5 Tahun 2014 tentang Aparatur Sipil Negara. (2014).
- Wikipedia Indonesia. (2017, Januari 29). *Publikasi Ilmiah*. Diambil kembali dari [wikipedia.org](https://id.wikipedia.org/wiki/Publikasi_ilmiah): https://id.wikipedia.org/wiki/Publikasi_ilmiah
- Zuhriyah, D. A. (2018, April). *Menristekdikti Targetkan Publikasi Ilmiah Internasional Indonesia Terbaik di Asia Tenggara*. Diambil kembali dari <http://kabar24.bisnis.com/read/20181201/255/865271/menristekdikti-targetkan-publikasi-ilmiah-internasional-indonesia-terbaik-di-asia-tenggara>.