The Dynamics of Research Activities and the Quality of Scientific Publications of Professors: A Case Study of Islamic State University (UIN) Syarif Hidayatullah Jakarta

Imam Subchi¹, Rena Latifa¹, Maria Ulfã¹, Desi Nahartini¹ and Dede Rosyada¹

¹UIN Syarif Hidayatullah Jakarta, Indonesia

Keywords: professors, research, professors’ publication, scientific journal

Abstract: A professor is an expert who occupies a privileged position in a higher education institution. His expertise in a field of study is often an inspiration for young lecturers and students to conduct research and to write scientific articles. Usually, professors are often associated with scientific activities such as research and writing scientific papers, in addition to their obligations, namely teaching and community service. However, the facts of the ground do not always support the idea. This study presents a descriptive-analytical study on the background of the decline in the professors’ enthusiasm in research and article writing activities in international scientific journals at UIN Syarif Hidayatullah Jakarta. The aim of this study is to find out the reason why professors are not too interested in scientific activities. In fact, the scientific activities, such as research, writing books and articles in international scientific journals, are one of the obligations that must be fulfilled. To obtain the data, the authors carried out a number of research steps including tracing oral and document sources, verification of sources, data analysis and then writing research results as the final step. The data was collected by using purposive sampling method with interviewing several professors representing faculties at UIN Jakarta. The results of this study showed a decrease in research activity and the quality of scientific publications of UIN Jakarta professors due to the following factors: (1) professors play a role as structural officials concurrently so that there is no time to conduct any research, (2) age and health factors that affect the productivity of professors, (3) supporting facilities in each faculty are not evenly distributed for research purposes, (4) mastery of foreign languages is not optimal.

1 INTRODUCTION

In a university, there are generally main professions in it, namely: lecturers, students, and employees. Lecturers are an important element as science developers. In accordance with the Tridarma of Higher Education, lecturers (also students) have self-development opportunities in teaching, research, and community service. Lecturers have a greater chance than students in realizing tasks in all those three activities.

By conducting research, lecturers have an opportunity to improve their scientific careers. The culmination of this achievement is when the lecturer holds the status of a professor. Referring to Law No. 14/2015 concerning Teachers and Lecturers, it explains that professor is the highest functional position for lecturers who teach in a higher education unit (article 1 (3)), or in another explanation it is stated that professor is the highest academic position in a higher education unit which has an authority to guide doctoral candidates (article 49).

Lecturers who get the title of professor must meet a number of requirements. Based on Permendikbud No. 92/2014 article 10, it explains that the main requirement to become a professor includes holding doctoral academic qualification (S3) and having scientific works published in reputable international scientific journals as the first author. The publication of scientific papers in international scientific journals is considered as one of important indicators in the requirements of professors. This is considered to be one of the highest achievements for a scientist because it is a proof of the recognition from international scientific community. Besides being a requirement, this journal publication is also one of the activities that must be carried out by a professor later on.

1429
The objective of this study is to find out the dynamics of research activities and the quality of scientific publications among professors of UIN Syarif Hidayatullah Jakarta. The authors assumed that there is a decreasing interest in research among professors along with the decline in the quality of publication (to publish scientific works), both in the form of books and reputable international journals. For professors, research activities and publishing scientific papers are parts of improving quality, competence, professionalism, and one of the indicators of their performance.

1.1 Literature Framework

Professor is an important part of the scientific community in universities. Their opinions are often heard, cited, developed into deeper synthesis, or even spark a long scientific discussion. Commonly, the presence of a professor is awaited as the most authoritative figure discussing a topic of knowledge. However, recently a professor is also required to perpetuate their ideas in books or be published in reputable scientific journals.

Professor is a senior lecturer who has a permanent lecturer status. Referring to Law No. 14/2015 concerning Teachers and Lecturers (article 48), it is stated that the position of a permanent lecturer starts from a low to high level, namely; expert assistant, lecturer, chief of lecturers and professor. Regarding the position of lecturers, there is also a term known as academic positions. According to Permendikbud No. 92/2004 concerning Technical Guidance for Research on Credit Figures Article 1 (6), an academic position of a lecturer is a position that refers to the duties, responsibilities, authorities and rights of a lecturer in a higher education unit in which its implementation is based on certain expertise and is independent.

In addition to having an obligation as a lecturer, a professor has some specific obligations. In Law No. 14/2015 Article 49 (2), it is stated that the specific obligation of professors is to write books and scientific works, and to disseminate their ideas to enlighten society. Correspondingly this duty is explained in Permendikbud No. 78/2003 concerning the Reporting of Professional Allowances and Honoraries for lecturers occupying Professor Academic Position. In article 4 (1) of this regulation, it is stated that the specific obligations of professors are: (1) to write books published by national and international publishers which have ISBNs (International Standard of Book Numbering System); (2) to produce scientific works published in reputable international journals, and; (3) to disseminate ideas.

The specific duty above leads to the productivity of a professor in creating scientific works that can be published in reputable international journals. This scientific activity is useful in promoting a professor to reach the highest level of professor known as plenary professors. According to Law No. 14/2015 Article 49 (3), it explains that professors who have scientific works or other monumental and special works in their fields, and obtain international recognition, can be appointed as plenary professors. In other words, a lecturer who has occupied the position of professor can still continue his intellectual career until the plenary professor. This level can be obtained from the scientific productivity.

A series of scientific activities undertaken by a professor has been appreciated by the Government with a number of facilities. Referring to Law No. 14/2015, in addition to getting professional allowances as a lecturer, a professor receives honorarium. This kind of allowance is the provision of an additional fee twice as much as the professor's basic salary as stipulated by the government (article 56). The provision of this honorarium has proven the government's attention to the profession of professor. Besides, this is the government appreciation of the specific obligations fulfilled by professors.

Another benefit of being a professor is the extension of retirement age of civil servants up to the age of 70 years, for professors who excel (article 67). By the extension of this service period, professors are expected to continue practicing the Tridarma of Higher Education and increase their scientific productivity for universities in particular, and community in general. The honorarium and the extension of professors retirement age are also explained completely in Permendikbud No. 78/2003 on the Reporting of Professional Allowances and Honoraries for Lecturers occupying Professor Academic Position.

The main work of professors is writing and publishing scientific papers. Based on Permendikbud No. 78/2003, it is stated that the specific obligations of professors include writing books published with ISBNs and producing scientific works published in reputable international journals. The word reputation here refers to a number of journals indexed by international journal index institutions such as Scopus, Thompson-Reuters, Atlantis and others. Both, writing books
and publishing scientific papers in journals, are the forms of scientific works of a professor. Citing Permendikbud No. 92/2014 concerning Technical Guidelines for the Implementation of Research Credit Score article 1 (9), it is stated that scientific writing is the writing of the basic thoughts, development and results of studies / research compiled by lecturers, either individuals or groups, which discusses a scientific topic in the field of education, research and community service by expressing certain ideas through identification, literature review, methodology, synthesis, description, analysis, evaluation, conclusions and suggestions for solutions. In this definition there is an affirmation that a scientific work is not only in the research field, but also includes the field of education and community service which is processed into a scientific writing.

Professors’ productivity is related to their quality as a figure who is considered to be the most expert in a scientific field. In this case, quality is an interesting topic to study. The study of quality development relies on a number of key words such as quality, competence, professional and performance. Sallis explained that the meaning of quality occupies an absolute and relative concept. As something absolute, quality can be paired with a good, beautiful and trustworthy environment, or something that is ideal with nothing comparable. In a relative definition, especially in quality management, quality is not interpreted as a product or service, but something related to the measurement of specialization or suitability with the customer's preferences. Quality is not something that is expensive or exclusive, and can be considered good if a satisfaction is judged by the user's standards. Quality can be understood as the best satisfaction and in accordance with the customer needs.

The development of lecturer quality includes several competencies. In general, the definition of competence, based on Law No. 14/2015 on Teachers and Lecturers in article 1 (10), is a set of knowledge, skills and behaviours that must be possessed, lived and mastered by the teacher or lecturer in carrying out professional tasks. Article 69 states that coaching and professional development of lecturers include pedagogic competence, personal competence, social competence and professional competence. These competencies are explained in the Explanation of Law No. 14/2015 article 10 (1), as follows:

1) Pedagogic competence is the ability to manage students’ learning
2) Personality competence is a personal ability that is strong, noble, wise and authoritative as well as being a role model for students
3) Professional competence is the ability to master the subject matter in depth
4) Social competence is the ability of the teacher / lecturer to communicate and interact effectively and efficiently with students, fellow teachers, parents / guardians of students and the surrounding community.

Particularly, according to Minister of Education and Culture Regulation No. 92/2014 article 1 (12), competence is the ability required for lecturers to be able to carry out activities in the field of education, research and community service in relation to the aspects of knowledge, skills and / or expertise, as well as certain work attitudes relevant to the duties and terms of the office. In this paper, the focus of competence is the emphasis on specific obligations for professors in research or productivity in writing scientific papers based on research and its paper publication.

The implementation and achievement of competencies are related to professionalism. According to Law No. 14/2015 on Teachers and Lecturers article 1 (4), professionalism is defined as a work or activity that is carried out by a person and becomes a source of life income which requires expertise, skills and talents that meet certain quality standards or norms and require professional education. Article 7 explains the Principles of Professionalism of Lecturers, namely: The profession of teachers and lecturers is a special field of work carried out based on the following principles:

1) Having talent, interest, desire and idealism
2) Having a commitment to improve the quality of education, faith, piety and noble character
3) Having an academic qualification and educational background in accordance with the task area
4) Having the required competencies in accordance with the task area
5) Having the responsibilities for the implementation of professional duties
6) Earning income determined by work performance
7) Having the opportunity to develop professionalism on an ongoing basis with lifelong learning
8) Having a guarantee of legal protection in carrying out professional duties
9) Having a professional organization which has an authority to regulate matters related to the task of teacher professionalism. Professionalism is closely related to performance. Mangkunegara defines performance as the work result in the quality and quantity achieved by an employee in carrying out their duties in accordance with the responsibilities assigned to him. M. Hasibuan stated that performance is a work result obtained by a person after completing the tasks assigned to him based on skills, experience, sincerity and time of work. Meanwhile, As'ad tends to view performance as a result achieved by a person according to the applied standards. In other words, performance is interpreted as the result of one's efforts achieved by abilities and actions in certain situations. Whereas performance appraisal is defined as the process of evaluating or the evaluation of performance carried out by an organization for the performance of its employees.

Lecturers in universities have a strategic role in education. They are professionals who make a lot of contributions in the development of educational quality such as the quality of lecturers, students and higher education institutions, according to their main duties, competencies and functions. The development of education quality can be achieved by targeting the lecturer quality. Miller said that in education, it has the man behind the system which means a decisive human position in the power of education. Thus, education is a service industry that acts as a front line provider and determines the quality of service delivery systems. In this context, the position of lecturers is at the forefront in determining the quality of service. The success of a university that is innovative, quality and responsive to local challenges and global developments lies in the work of development and improvement. The main agents of this work are college lecturers.

Theoretically, many factors can influence the role of lecturers. Sopiah mentioned that the factors that influence individual behaviour are effort, ability and environment. Muchlas explained that adult behaviour and personality are influenced by hereditary and environmental backgrounds with the 'variables' of situational conditions. On the contrary, Mathis and Jackson believe that the factors that influence an individual's work depend on individual abilities (talents, interests, personalities, etc.), the level of effort undertaken (motivation, ethics, attendance, etc.), and organizational support (culture, equipment and technology).

Castteter stated that the factors which affect a person basically come from himself, the organization and the external environment. Self-influenced stimulus include: intellectual weakness, physiological weakness, demotivation, personality factors, aging phase, position preparation and value orientation. Influences originating from the organization include: organizational systems, organizational roles, behaviour related to supervision, organizational climate and organizational culture. While the influence of the external environment includes: family, economic conditions, politics, law, social values, the labour market, technological changes and associations. The role of the lecturer in quality assurance in universities, as referred to in this working paper, is interpreted as the behaviour of lecturers with regard to the tasks of learning, research and community service, but the discussion will deal much more with the problem of research activities and the writing of their scientific work.

2. RESEARCH METHODS

The sample of this study was 10 professors selected using a sampling method called purposive sampling. In this technique, who is determined to be a member of the sample depends on the consideration of the researcher. The sample is someone who is considered to be in accordance with the purposes and objectives of the study. In practice, a researcher is permitted to appoint a 'data collector' who is assigned to look for a sample with relevant criteria and objectives.

The samples chosen were professors from different faculties of UIN Jakarta. The criteria in determining the sample include: 1) professors who served in the campus structure; 2) professors who have held positions to handle the quality management of lecturers and professors; 3) professors who have written in international journals or conducted international research.

This research was conducted in qualitative method. This method relies on the description of data such as the results of observation, documentation and interviews. This research can also be called descriptive - qualitative research. Referring to Usman and his colleagues' explanation, this type of research is related to the effort to understand and interpret the meaning of an interaction or human behaviour in certain circumstances based on the researchers' point of view.

First, the authors collected some resources by interviews and document collection. In addition, an
observation was carried out to support other sources. Second, the existing sources were then classified and verified. Third, the data was analysed and then a report was written as the final step.

3 RESULTS AND DISCUSSIONS

The development of the professor's quality at UIN Jakarta is related to the scientific productivity that he has achieved. Not only does the professor write or compile reports, but also publishes his works in books with ISBN and in reputable international journals. Particularly in UIN Jakarta, these activities have generally been carried out by most professors. In 2015, these activities experienced several dynamics to be explained further.

Until 2015, the total number of professors at UIN Jakarta was 68 persons. Four professors retired by December 2015 so that the number was 64 persons. Referring to the Strategic Plan of UIN Jakarta in 2012-2016, the achievement of the number of professors consecutively was 7.5%, 10%, 12%, 15% and 17.5% of the total number of lecturers in that year. This year, the number of professors at UIN Jakarta should be 15% of the total number of lecturers reaching 931 people. If it is recalculated, the number of professors should be 140 persons. This number is still far from the number of existing professors. This year, UIN was only able to have two more professors, Prof. Dr. Munzier Suparta, M. A., (a professor of Educational Sciences Faculty) and Prof. Dr. Ari Sumantri, SKM, M. Kes (a professor of Medical and Health Sciences Faculty).

Thus, the number of UIN Jakarta professors is 66 persons or only 7.1% of the total 931 percent. In the next five years, up to 2020, the number of professors who will have retired is 17 persons. If this is not anticipated, the vision of UIN Jakarta to become a world class university in 2026 will not be achieved.

The minimum number of professors is at least as many as the number of published scientific papers. Referring to Strategic Plan of UIN Jakarta in 2012-2016, it is stated that one of the important points related to the professors' activities lies in improving the culture and quality of research, research participation, publication of scientific works, and dissemination of research results. Citing a study by the Institute of Research and Community Service (LP2M) UIN Jakarta in 2014, it was found that the number of professors' scientific works was still minimal, especially those published in reputable international journals. Most UIN Jakarta professors carried out mostly community service activities.

The lack of scientific publications at UIN Jakarta seems to be in common with what happens in universities in Indonesia in general. The number of lecturers' scientific works published is still very low, even compared to other ASEAN countries. According to the findings from the SCImago Survey in 1996-2008, Indonesia was in 64th place out of 234 countries surveyed. Other ASEAN countries, such as Singapore was at the 31st place, Thailand in the 42nd, and Malaysia in the 48th. The number of Indonesian publications in this period was only 9,194 documents.

Based on the results of a study by LP2M UIN Jakarta in 2014 on professors and their scientific works, it was found that the implementation of the Tridharma Higher Education by professors was dominated by activities in the field of education (teaching) and community service, while the aspect of research was only a few. In fact, the amount of research grant from UIN Jakarta in 2014 reached 10 billion. From 2011 to 2014, the amount of research grants had been increasing. The amount of research funds in 2014 increased from the previous year which was only 5.5 billion. In fact, this fund was provided to all UIN Jakarta lecturers, including professors. However, it was found that among many lecturers who received 2014 research grants, not all professors received the funds. In other words, some professors did not conduct any research.

The scarcity of professors' participation in research was also found in a few years before 2014. In 2011, there were only 14 professors (7.6%) out of 178 lecturers who took part in the research with the funds sourced from UIN Jakarta. In 2012, the number declined. The researchers in that year consisted of 143 lecturers with only 5 professors (3.5%). In 2013, 575 lecturers were awarded the research grants, but there were only 19 professors (3.3%) involved in it. Compared to the total number of professors in that year that was 65 persons, only 34.5% of professors involved in research. By 2014, the number of lecturers involved in research was decreasing. In fact, the research funds in this year were far greater than in the previous year. This year, the number of lecturers involved in research was 241 persons and only 5 professors (2.1%). In 2015, the number of research grants increased. On this occasion, there were only 8 research studies conducted by professors (2.3%) out of 377 research studies which received the research funds. Below is a research budget table of UIN Jakarta in 2011-2015:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Year</th>
<th>Research Grants (Billion)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>2011</td>
<td>5.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2012</td>
<td>10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2013</td>
<td>5.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2014</td>
<td>10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2015</td>
<td>10</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
According to the findings of past research, there were several reasons why professors’ contribution in publication, particularly in reputable international journals, decreased. To obtain valid data, the authors conducted a number of interviews with professors of UIN SyarifHidayatullah. Despite their subjective point of view, the information adequately provided a general understanding for the main reasons of the reluctance among professors in writing scientific papers. The results of this study revealed that there were several factors which led to the scarcity of the professors’ participation in research and scientific writing.

First, professors concurrently hold structural positions. AzyumardiAzra, a professor of history of Islamic culture who is also the chancellor of UIN Jakarta (1998 - 2002 and 2002 - 2006), stated that the main reason of the absence of professors in research is because some of them occupy structural officials position in an institution. This circumstance results in the limited time to research and write. In fact, they are not an administrator, but scientists. The commitment to research and write is a tradition that must not be abandoned. This is an academic responsibility that must be fulfilled.

Azyumardi explained that when he served as chancellor of UIN Jakarta for two periods, he tried to fulfil all of his academic obligations. At that time, he had to go through his days with a very busy schedule. In the midst of his activities, he still made use of his time to research and write. He claimed that even though he was in the highest position in the university, his profession as a lecturer was an academic burden that must be considered. When he was entrusted with the position of postgraduate director of UIN Jakarta Director in 2007 - 2014, he still had to share his time with the other position, Deputy of Welfare in the Vice President Office served by JusufKalla. He tried to take his time to fulfil his intellectual obligations by the publication of books or other scientific works.

Second, the age and health factor of the professors also determine the lack of interest in conducting research and writing. The data obtained shows that most professors, 33 out of 64 professors per December 2015, are 60 to 69 years old, or close to the retirement period of 70 years. As the age is getting elder with sometimes followed by declining health conditions, the professors’ scientific productivity is decreasing. Huzaemah T Yanggo, another professor of school of comparative jurisprudence in UIN Jakarta, justified that age and health are problems for professors in conducting research and writing activities. Usually, they will need the help of assistants regarding technical matters.

In line with Huzaemah, Lily SurrayaEkaPutri, the professor of general biology, she said that the performance of professors over the age of 60 is different from those below this age. In fact, they are obliged to produce scientific works, both in the form of books and articles published in reputable scientific journals. Employing assistants who are accustomed to scientific activities seems to be a solution to overcome the problem of scientific productivity of senior professors. The professors can still contribute in the academic field by contributing their ideas, while the technical matters are performed by their assistants.

The minimum number of nationally accredited journals and reputable international journals at UIN Jakarta is the third reason. The existence of journals as an application for the ideas of professors has become important. A journal is where lecturers disseminate the results of their research to public. In

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>No</th>
<th>Year</th>
<th>Budget</th>
<th>Number of Lecturers</th>
<th>Number of Professors</th>
<th>Percentage of Professors</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>2011</td>
<td>IDR 2,465,000,000</td>
<td>178 lecturers</td>
<td>14</td>
<td>7.6%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>2012</td>
<td>IDR 2,385,000,000</td>
<td>143 lecturers</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>3.5%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>2013</td>
<td>IDR 5,498,000,000</td>
<td>575 lecturers</td>
<td>19</td>
<td>3.3%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>2014</td>
<td>IDR 10,092,000,000</td>
<td>241 lecturers</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>2.1%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>2015</td>
<td>IDR 10,950,000,000</td>
<td>394 research</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>3%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

(Source: LP2M 2014 & SK KPA Determination of Research Title and 2015 Research Grant Awardee)

The data above shows that the amount of research grants in 2011 - 2015 was increasing every year, not in line with the involvement of professors in conducting research. This scarcity has impacted on the number of published scientific papers, both in the form of books with ISBN and in scientific papers published by reputable international journals. This finding needs to be studied more deeply in terms of the factors underlying the inhibition of the professors’ scientific productivity.
2015, there were 45 journals in UIN Jakarta, but not all of them were published regularly. There were only 2 journals, *Ahkam* and *Iqtiṣād* (both under the management of the Faculty of Shari'ah and Law), nationally accredited by the National Accreditation Board of Higher Education (BAN-PT). The journal with an international reputation was only *Studia Islamika*.

The fourth factor is the supporting facilities for professors in each faculty. The construction of faculty buildings in UIN Jakarta varies. Not all of them provides a special room for professors. There are professors’ rooms in some faculties, but they are still general. This means one room for all professors. This is a challenge for faculty officials and study programs to overcome this shortcoming. With an adequate personal space, the concentration of research and the article writing can be maintained.

Fifth, there is no research facility available. Oman Fathurrahman, a professor in philology, believes that to improve the quality of professors, the existence of research facilities is absolutely necessary. Once this facility has been built, the next step is to strengthen the research tradition. Before that, the professors’ skills must first be mapped. This mapping is useful to facilitate their empowerment. Professors must also be given a broad access to obtain primary sources of their research.

The foreign language skill, both oral and written, is the sixth factor. English is an international language including the scientific field. The mastery of English is an important requirement for the dissemination of research results, both in the form of writing for international journals and for presentations in international forums. Facts on the ground show that mastery of English is not fully comprehended by professors of UIN Jakarta. For professors, who have studied at Western universities where English is the medium of instruction, English is not a problem.

Finally, the last factor is regarding research funding. Every year UIN Jakarta provides research grant funds for UIN Jakarta lecturers through the Research and Publishing Centre (Puslitpen) and LP2M, but from year to year the fact is that there are not many professors accessing the funds. The number of professors who participated in this research program was only about 2.1% of the total number of recipients of research funds in 2015. This reality occurred due to several reasons including the imbalance in the amount of funds and the population of lecturers, including professors who could access it. Nevertheless, there is an evidence that not all professors submit their research proposals. In addition, a number of proposals was not selected in the selection process, including those submitted by professors.

Based on the barriers described above, the main problem of the professors is not only on their own, but also on UIN Jakarta. The existence of professors is an important element for the institution. This is because their position plays a role as the main trigger for the progress of the university. Mastna, a professor of teacher science and former Vice Chancellor for Academic Affairs, said that the interest of professors is not only personal matters but also the responsibility of study programs, faculties and universities.

4 CONCLUSIONS

Professors at UIN Jakarta are important elements as a science developers. Their existence determines the quality of the institution. However, professors are not people who only cultivate their expertise, but also must continue to be dynamic in the academic world, one of which is by increasing their involvement in research and writing books and international scientific journals. These activities complement their other duties, namely teaching and community service, as reflected in the Tri Dharma of Higher Education.

According to the results of the study, it is shown that throughout 2015 (even in previous years since 2011) not all professors were active in research field. UIN Jakarta has allocated annual grant funds (as of 2011) that can be accessed by all lecturers, including professors. Apparently, not all professors were involved in this study. In fact, its number is less than half of the population. It indicates that there are serious problems must be addressed immediately. The quality of professors can reach a sharp decline if this situation keeps going. This problem must be solved not only by the professor himself, but also by the management officials of the study program, the faculty as well as the university.

REFERENCES

E. Sallis, *Total quality management in education* (London: Kogan Page, 2003), hal. 34.
Permenkabd No. 78/2003.
SK KPA Penetapan Judul Penelitian dan Penerima Dana Hibah Penelitian Tahun 2015.
Usman dkk, *Metodologi Penelitian Sosial (edisi kedua)* (Jakarta: PT Bumi Aksara, 2011) hal. 78
UU No. 14/2015 pasal 49.
Wawancara dengan Huzaimah T. Yanggo, Guru Besar bidang Fiqih Perbandingan Mazhab UIN Jakarta
Wawancara dengan Lily Surraya Eka Putri, Guru Besar Ilmu Biologi Umum UIN Jakarta
Wawancara dengan Mastna, Guru Besar Bahasa Arab UIN Jakarta
Wawancara dengan Oman Fathurrahman, Guru Besar Filologi UIN Jakarta