Computer Games for Older Adults beyond Entertainment and Training: Possible Tools for Early Warnings

Concept and Proof of Concept

Béla Pataki¹, Péter Hanák² and Gábor Csukly³

¹Department of Measurement and Information Systems, Budapest University of Technology and Economics, Műegyetem rakpart 3., Budapest, H-1111, Hungary
²Healthcare Technologies Knowledge Centre, Budapest University of Technology and Economics, Műegyetem rakpart 3., Budapest, H-1111, Hungary
³Department of Psychiatry and Psychotherapy, Semmelweis University, Balassa utca 6., Budapest, H-1038, Hungary

Keywords: Computer Games, Serious Games, Silver Games, Cognitive Disorders, Mild Cognitive Impairment (MCI).

Abstract: Old age cognitive deficit is a relatively new mass-phenomenon due to the fast growth of older populations, and the fact that dementia is chronic, progressive, long lasting and, so far, incurable. However, in the early phase of cognitive decline symptoms do not manifest clearly, and may remain unexplored for a longer period of time. Clinical tests, using either paper-based or computerized methods, are made quite infrequently, providing too sparse snapshots of the cognitive performance. In this paper, computer games are proposed for home monitoring of possible significant changes in mental state. This approach is advantageous as it is a regular but voluntary method. This way, more frequent assessments are possible than with the traditional clinical test scenario. Problem descriptions, possible solutions and methods, presented in this paper, have been elaborated in the AAL project Maintaining and Measuring Mental Wellness (M3W). The ultimate goal of the project is to develop a computer game toolset and a methodology for monitoring the mental state of older adults remotely (at home). As it is a complex task, only basic considerations and concepts, a few challenges, problems and potential solutions, the proposed architecture, and the proofs of the concept are presented in the paper.

1 INTRODUCTION

The world's population is aging: “those aged 65 years or over will account for 28.7 % of the EU-28’s population by 2080, compared with 18.2 % in 2013. As a result of the population movement between age groups, the EU-28’s old-age dependency ratio is projected to almost double from 27.5 % in 2013 to 51.0 % by 2080 (Eurostat, 2014).

Older adults have to cope with physical and mental impairments. Old age cognitive deficit is a relatively new mass-phenomenon due to the fast growth of older populations, and the fact that dementia is chronic, progressive, long lasting and, so far, incurable. According to Alzheimer's Research UK, “the annual economic cost of dementia is nearly the same as the combined economic costs of cancer and heart disease” (Alzheimer’s, 2014). In December 2013, the G8 dementia summit called for strengthening and joining efforts to “identify a cure or a disease-modifying therapy for dementia by 2025”, and acknowledged prevention, timely diagnosis and early intervention of dementia as innovation priorities (Gov.UK, 2013).

Various paper- and object-based psychological tests have been in use since the beginning of the 20th century, aiming at recognizing cognitive disorders. Recently, their computerized variants as well as neuroimaging methods have been available for diagnostic purposes in clinics. As these are expensive and need the contribution of specialists, they are not suitable for mass screening.

In this paper, we propose to use computer games for the home monitoring of eventual significant changes in mental state. This approach is advantageous as it is a regular but voluntary method. This way, more frequent assessments are possible than with the traditional clinical test scenario.

Section 2 and 3 characterize briefly variants of cognitive impairments and their recognition possibilities. Section 4 presents the conceptual model of the
proposed system for the assessment of mental changes. Section 5 describes the system developed in the Maintaining and Measuring Mental Wellness (M3W) project: first, it summarizes the so-called early pilot, then sketches the M3W ICT architecture, presents the game categories, and finally introduces the logging and scoring procedures. Section 6 discusses evaluation challenges and proposes several approaches. Section 7 presents proofs of the detection method. Finally, Section 8 summarizes our findings, and shows directions for further work.

2 COGNITIVE IMPAIRMENTS

The early sign of having a higher risk for a pathological decrease in cognition is called Mild Cognitive Impairment, abbreviated as MCI (Werner, 2008); in this state, conversion to dementia is much higher (>10-15%) than with healthy older people. The importance of recognizing the population at risk is underlined by scientific data showing that treatment initiated in the early phase can prolong this phase, and improve the ability for independence (Budd, 2011). However, in the early phase of cognitive decline symptoms do not manifest clearly, and may remain unexplored for a longer period of time. Further, it is not easy to identify the stage at which the process becomes abnormal, and the affected person requires serious attention, perhaps medical intervention, as MCI is a set of symptoms rather than a specific medical condition or disease. A person with MCI has subtle problems with one or more of the following (Alzheimer’s, 2015):

- day-to-day memory,
- planning,
- language,
- attention,
- visuospatial skills (the ability to interpret objects and shapes).

With early detection of MCI people at risk can get advice, support and therapy in time. Early diagnosis also allows people to plan ahead while they are still able to do so. As said above, cognitive decline can be significantly slowed down in an early stage. However, early detection is rare because cognitive tests are usually performed only when there are clear signs of cognitive deficit. The natural denying effect by the older adult, their family members and friends may lead to significant additional delays.

Traditional, validated, paper-based clinical tests constitute the gold standard but they have several drawbacks. Such tests require specialist centres and highly trained professionals. Therefore, there is a growing interest in the development of computerized cognitive assessment batteries (Cantab, 2015), (MindStreams, 2015), (Dwolatzky, 2011). However, clinical tests, using either paper-based or computerized methods, are made quite infrequently, providing too sparse snapshots of the cognitive performance.

3 GAMIFYING MCI DETECTION

Regular home – remote – monitoring of changes in mental state offers a powerful alternative, even if it allows only relatively noisy and less targeted measurements. It has the advantage of frequent assessments, and thus it offers the possibility of evaluating temporal trends. Current computerized and clinically validated tests are not suitable for this purpose as they have been developed for professional use; in consequence, they are expensive, not entertaining, and require the presence of medical staff. Therefore, new measurement methodologies should be developed and validated, specifically for this strategy.

As more and more older adults use computers, and many of them play computer games regularly, this activity can be exploited for measuring their performance in those games. According to some experimental studies, this performance is related to their cognitive state. In consequence, there is a growing interest in the development of special computer games for cognitive monitoring and training purposes, addressing specific cognitive domains, such as verbal fluency (Jimison, 2008), executive functions (López-Martínez, 2011), or perceptual and motor functions (Ogomori, 2011).

A major challenge in using computer games instead of cognitive tests is that entertainment capability and measurement power pose contradictory requirements. There are three approaches in game development for older adults, namely

- adapting well-known, popular games (e.g., chess, Tangram or Tic-tac-toe (Menza-Kubo, 2013), Find the Pairs, FreeCell (M3W, 2015);
- transforming special clinical tests, e.g., Corsi block-tapping, paired associates learning, Wisconsin card sorting (M3W, 2015), into games;
- developing new games specially designed for this purpose (López-Martínez, 2011).

Regular monitoring may be (1) controlled or (2) voluntary. Controlled monitoring works only with a highly motivated minority; since most older adults are mentally healthy in the early monitoring period.
(i.e., before detecting a decline), they deny to participate in controlled monitoring as it seems to undermine their preferred independence.

Our basic idea is the following: with regular but voluntary use of computer games developed or modified specifically for older adults, we may be able to measure the mental changes and tendencies over time in an entertaining way.

The problems, possible solutions and methods, presented in this paper, are based on a recent research project, Maintaining and Measuring Mental Wellness (M3W, 2015), (Sirály, 2013), (Hanák, 2013). The ultimate goal of the project is to develop a toolset and a methodology for monitoring the mental state of older adults remotely (e.g., at home), which is a very complex task. Therefore, only the basic considerations and concepts, a few challenges, problems and solutions, the proposed architecture, and the proofs of the concept are presented in this paper. Many other important problems, such as player motivation and game selection, are not discussed here in detail.

One of the biggest challenges is to find the right balance between entertainment capability and measurement power. In order to cope with this challenge, the game set has been evolving since our early pilot experiments, performed in 2012/2013. Unfortunately, the changing of the games and the collected data poses another significant challenge as basically non-comparable data have to be compared somehow in the long run. To this end, we propose a kind of sensor-fusion approach that will be described later, in Section 6.

4 CONCEPTUAL MODEL

The basic conceptual model of the proposed system is shown in Figure 1. The final goal is to provide appropriate long-term feedback (warning) to the user or to a caregiver, family member, medical expert, etc., when a significant change in mental state has occurred. Short-term feedback is needed as motivation to continue participation in the monitoring.

Several games have been considered. Most of the chosen ones are logical puzzles, or games that need the intensive use of the short-term memory (its deterioration is one of the best indicators of MCI), but other important cognitive abilities and processes (attention, executive function, comprehension, language skills, planning, decision making, etc.) are targeted as well (see details in Section 5).

Two types of basic parameters are measured currently: the solving time of the puzzle and the amount of the good and bad steps taken during the solution.

Beyond the general problems of such systems (e.g., data privacy concerns), this approach has its special challenges:

1) How to measure cognitive performance using computer games?
2) How to cope with the typically heavy noise of the uncontrolled (home) measurement environment?
3) How to motivate people to take part in the long run?
4) How to compare performance shown in different games, which is basically a special sensor-fusion problem?

After describing the ICT architecture and components in the next section, we shall propose various
approaches and procedures as possible answers to these challenges.

5 ICT ARCHITECTURE AND COMPONENTS

5.1 Early Pilot

In a one-year pilot study in 2012/2013, more than 50 volunteers registered to take part and help evaluate the framework and the games developed at that time. Due to the voluntary nature of the project only about 20 of them played regularly for nearly one year at home and in an elderly home. (Of course, the parallel development of the program package was a drawback for the players.) The average age of these regular players was 70.3, and the standard deviation was 10.9 years.

Because of the relatively short test period, its relevance was limited in regard to mental aging; nonetheless, we found some findings as clearly important for the long run as well. Parallel to the home monitoring pilot study, clinical examinations on patients with mental problems (MCI, Alzheimer’s disease, etc.) were also performed (Sirály, 2013); (Sirály, 2015).

The software package for the early pilot was written in Java, and had to be downloaded and installed; it was a challenge for many older adults. Recent advancements of internet and browser technologies have made it possible to develop the software in HTML5, JavaScript and PHP in the second phase, go online, and become available on various platforms, including touchscreen devices.

5.2 Global Architecture

The current implementation is composed of the M3W frame and the set of games – the Game Service. The M3W frame ensures a unified layout and provides various services to the games, incl. completing and passing the game logs to the Data Service. The Game Service can be displayed in a big-enough iframe in any webpage. Authentication and authorization – i.e. provision of a User Register – is the responsibility of the webserver hosting the Game Service.

For older adults, especially for those with limited computer skills and, to some extent, affected by cognitive impairment, ease of use (incl. easy registration and login) is especially important. For them, modern Single-Sign-On (SSO) solutions can be very helpful. Therefore, despite the immature status of and frequent changes in SSO applications, we have implemented such services based on an open source solution, simpleSAMLphp (SSP) that is used worldwide in higher education. With SSP, on the one hand, a so-called identity provider (IdP) can integrate authentication services of a number of external authentication sources, incl. social login services offered by social network providers, such as Google, Facebook and LinkedIn. On the other hand, a web-service can be amended by a so-called service provider (SP) with SSP such that this webservice can utilize the authentication mechanisms of one or more IdPs.

![Figure 3: Simple distributed architecture.](image)

In the simplest case, User Register (UR), Game Service (GS) and Data Service (DS) can run on the same server (e.g., a Drupal 7 instance may be used for this purpose). A simple distributed architecture is depicted in Figure 3.

![Figure 4: Complex distributed architecture.](image)

Sometimes more sophisticated architectures are needed. For example, with a high number of users the load on a single GS may be too high, and a second GS has to be added. In another situation, privacy concerns or regulations might require that the UR remain under the authority of an institution, or within a country, so the UR must be duplicated or even multiplied. Further, the collected data might be considered as sensitive despite that they contain no personal data only an integer player identifier. In such situations, it must be ensured that the DS be duplicated or multiplied. SSP ensures the necessary scalability and connectivity also in such cases. Figure 4 illustrates a situation where a complex M3W system is realized by two DS, three GS, three UR and six SSP instances, and other external services.

Note that both GS and UR services can be realized without Drupal.
5.3 Cognitive Abilities and Game Categories

Cognitive abilities are mental skills needed to carry out tasks. They are mechanisms of how we learn, remember, plan, execute, solve problems, pay attention, etc. Major categories of cognitive abilities are perception, attention, memory, motor skills, language skills, visual and spatial processing, and executive functions.

Cognitive tests – traditional or computerized – are designed to measure one of these abilities in order to maximize their assessment capability; they are not designed for frequent use. However, in case of cognitive games, their measurement potential must be accompanied by entertaining power as they must motivate the user to play regularly for a long time.

Figure 5: Snapshot of the M3W playground.

The M3W set of games tries to satisfy both major requirements. Each game belongs to at least one of five categories: attention, planning, language skill, memory and execution (see Figure 5). Most games try to focus on one cognitive category; e.g., Birds, Boxes, Differences or Lost Lego deals with attention, Find the Pairs with memory, Gopher with (motor) execution. Games belonging to category planning are usually more complex, i.e. more demanding; examples for such games are FreeCell, Sudoku, Blocks, Planargame, or Labyrinth (because of its complexity the latter was added more for entertainment than assessment).

Additionally, a few known tests are also made available in the category cognitive tests. They may be used as sort of reference: the results gained with these tests may be compared with the results gained with the games.

5.4 Game Logging

As mentioned in Section 4, the solving time and the amount of good and bad steps have recently been used for statistical analysis. However, parameters describing the game settings, the gaming platform and the course of playing the game are also recorded in the game logs; these data can and will be used later to compute suitable indicators. Settings are game-specific such as difficulty level, word length and language, turning or moving speed, appearance time, board size, etc. Platform parameters include monitor resolution, browser version, operating system, the use of mouse, touchpad or touchscreen, etc. The course of playing the game is described by all significant mouse clicks or touches with timestamps.

Game logs are json-objects, saved into files. Each game log consists of five components and several subcomponents:

1. Game descriptor
   numeric identifier; name category; version
2. Player identifier
   numeric identifier
3. Parameters:
   date, options, seed, platform, log version
4. Events
   game-specific series of time-stamped event-items
5. Statistics
   score, play time, game-specific aggregated values

5.5 Score Calculation

Scoring follows the same principle and procedure for every game. The highest reachable score depends on difficulty settings. On the lowest and highest difficulty levels the maximal score is 600 and 1000, respectively. High score limits on intermediate difficulty levels (i.e., between the lowest and highest levels) are distributed linearly. Difficulty levels are defined in the game settings.

In every game, various faults may occur that may lead to score deductions. Fault calculation may take playtime, bad move, wrong mouse click, erroneous selection, etc. into account. The extent or seriousness of a fault is called fault value. For each fault, there is a threshold, a limit and a weight. A fault value exceeding the threshold results in score deduction. A fault value reaching the limit causes maximal weighted deduction.
The common score calculator has four arguments: currentValues, goodValues, acceptableValues and weights.

Fault values are passed to the score calculator as currentValues, threshold values as goodValues, limits as acceptableValues, and weights as weights. With weight=1.0, a fault value reaching the limit sets the deduction to produce a score element of 333. Smaller weights produce smaller deductions, larger weights larger deductions.

The score calculator aggregates the deductions caused by various faults. During calculation, when the final score reaches 400, further deductions are reduced to one-third of their original values. When the final score reaches 200, score calculation stops.

![Game results](image)

Figure 6: Snapshot of a game result.

Primary score calculation is performed by the games themselves. The primary score is the basis for the immediate feedback to the user (see Figure 6).

Secondary score calculation is performed when stored game logs are reprocessed and uploaded into the database. The secondary score is used as an indicator of cognitive performance. (More sophisticated indicators might also be computed.) Since all original game logs are stored, score calculation may be refined later in order to improve our assessment methods, and thus the recognition of changes in mental wellness.

6 SUGGESTIONS TO MEET THE CHALLENGES

To assess the cognitive state, it is assumed that performance measured in playing computer games correlates with cognitive wellness. As it will be shown in Section 7, there is indirect evidence that this assumption is valid.

The measurement of the mental state on an absolute scale is very difficult as it depends on education, physical health, etc. For our purpose, fortunately, it is enough to detect only the change in a person’s cognitive performance, and it is an easier task.

For measuring change, a reference is needed. There are two possibilities: the performance of a person can be compared to the performance of other persons in a reference group; or it can be compared to a previously measured reference of the same person.

Because the person-to-person comparison is affected by several parameters that are unknown with this voluntary, uncontrolled method (education, physical abilities, family conditions, profession, environment, etc.) the comparison to the same person’s previous performance was chosen (c.f. Figure 7).

To cope with the heavy noise present, data are cleaned before analysis: outliers are detected and omitted. Outliers are usually caused by interrupts (due to social or physiological reasons). There is another noise term caused by random differences.
between consecutive puzzles, by minor environmental
turbulences, by tiredness, etc. It is reasonably
assumed that the short-term fluctuations are zero-
mean, stable independent random variables. To
decrease the assessment error caused by this noise
term, performance measured only in a single game
will not be evaluated; in its stead, performance
measured on a reference set will be compared to
performance on the current set (c.f. Figure 7).

While our goal is to detect the decline of perfor-
mance, in some periods improvements can occur as
well. The assumption is that the decline is preceded
by a longer period where the situation is stable or
deteriorating very slowly. Therefore, the reference is
chosen as the group of consecutive games in which
the person had shown stable performance (see Fig-
ure 7 and Figure 10).

The puzzle difficulty and the short-term change
of cognitive performance are both zero mean ran-
dom variables. The very slow, long-term change of
the cognitive state is modelled differently. There-
fore, if a change is detected in one of the integral
characteristics (mean, median, standard deviation),
or generally in the distribution of the composite
random variable (mental state plus game noise), then
it is caused by the slowly changing component mod-
elling the mental state.

In Figure 8, the distributions of the same perfor-
mance measure (puzzle solving time) in the same
game are shown for two players. In each diagram
two performance distributions of the given player
are drawn (red line: distribution of reference data,
blue line: distribution of current data). Of course, the
performance distributions of the same players in two
time periods will not be exactly the same, but statis-
tically the identical distribution assumption cannot
be rejected. However, for different players, not only
the parameters of the distributions differ from player
to player but the shapes are different as well.

It was investigated whether the parameter distri-
butions are Gaussian ones or not. The Lilliefors test
rejected the normality hypothesis in most of the
cases. Therefore, nonparametric tests are suggested
to check if the distribution has not changed the hy-
pothesis.

6.1 Nonparametric Tests

There are several applicable nonparametric tests, for
example the Mann-Whitney U test, the Kolmogorov-
Smirnov two-sample test, the Wilcoxon signed-rank
test, etc. Any of these methods can be used to com-
pare the distribution of the reference subset with the
distribution of the currently examined subset of the
time series, and normality is not necessary. If we
detect a difference between the distributions of the
two sub-samples, and the current part of the series
has a smaller average (of ranks, of scores, etc.), then
the player shows performance degradation. Up to
now, the Kolmogorov-Smirnov two-sample test and
the chi-square test were extensively used. It will be
investigated later which is the optimal statistical
hypothesis test for this kind of problems.

![Figure 8: Performance measure distributions of two play-
ers.](image)

The following findings were obtained:

- The results gained with the Kolmogorov-
  Smirnov two-sample test and the chi-square test
  have confirmed that both the stability and the
  change in the parameters are reliably estimated
  with these statistical hypothesis tests.
- In case of a new game a learning phase occurs
  when results are improving. The reference is
  meaningful only when the performance is stabi-
  lized (c.f. Figure 11).

6.2 Sensor Fusion with Games as
Sensors

Motivation of older adults to play frequently and
regularly in the computer games is one of the most
important challenges to solve. Early detection is the
purpose; but the main problem is that nobody knows
when the abnormal change will happen; maybe only
after many years, or in some persons’ life never.
Therefore, the motivation must be kept alive proba-
bly for years. It is a very complex problem in itself;
so only some aspects are discussed here. A basic
assumption is that although there is an intrinsic motivation that everybody wants to sustain mental abilities and an independent life of good quality, generally it is not enough as a motivation in the long-run. There must be other, extrinsic motivations, too, e.g., entertaining ways of measurement, and short-term, immediate feedback (c.f. Figure 1), encouraging the user to play further (e.g., scores, symbolic rewards, encouraging messages). Unfortunately, most people do not enjoy playing the same game for years. Therefore, in different time periods different games will be played by the same person. In order to preserve the level of motivation of the players, various games are offered (c.f. Figure 1 and 5). – In addition, as mentioned earlier, reprogrammed or improved games and more sophisticated logging may replace older ones as assessment methods are improving while time passes by, or technology changes occur. – The performance indicators measured with different games should somehow be compared to each other. This implies a sensor fusion and estimation problem; this was discussed in our previous paper (Breuer, 2015).

7 PROOF OF THE CONCEPT

Due to the long time needed to detect a critical cognitive change, no direct proof could be collected during the project till now. Nonetheless, by analyzing the game logs (more than 50 voluntary persons produced about 150 thousand game logs by playing the games during the second pilot) some important facts can be shown.

To provide some calibration, one of the computerized cognitive tests (Paired Associates Learning, PAL) was implemented in the M3W project, and players were asked to perform it. Studies have shown that MCI patients performed poorly on this test (Egerházi, 2007). Analyzing the performance of the voluntary players, it turned out that their performance shown in the computer games correlates to their performance measured by the PAL test (Sirály 2013), (Sirály, 2015).

In the PAL test, cards turn up in random positions after each other for 3 seconds, with abstract shapes shown on one or more cards. Other cards remain blank depending on the difficulty level. When all shapes have been shown, the previously shown shapes appear one by one in the centre of the play area, and the player has to choose the card where that shape has appeared earlier. The test consists of five different levels in eight stages in total, while the number of the shapes increases from 1 to 8 on the different stages. The player has 10 trials to complete a given stage, otherwise the test ends. The arrangement of the cards is asymmetric in the test, and it changes from stage to stage.

In Figure 10, PAL test performance versus average puzzle solving time of four players is shown. The PAL test was characterized by the trials needed to reach the highest level performed by the given player. Although there were much more participants who performed PAL tests, these 4 players were selected for demonstration as they all played more than 90 Freecell games. The outliers were omitted, and the averages of the playtimes were taken.

In a current study (Sirály, 2015) brain magnetic resonance (MR) examination was performed on 34 healthy older adults. Beyond the MR examination, paper based and computerized neuropsychological tests (i.e., PAL test) and computer games were applied. There was a correlation between the number of attempts and the time required to complete the
Figure 10: Performance reached at PAL tests and playing one of the games.

Find the Pairs (also called Memory) game and the volume of the entorhinal cortex, the temporal pole, and the hippocampus. There was also a correlation between the results of the PAL test and the Find the Pairs game.

Although no healthy → MCI transition occurred during the research period, the other change: significant improvement was detected several times. In Figure 11, performance of a player learning a new game is shown.

Applying the Kolmogorov-Smirnov two-sample test, the same distributions null hypothesis is
- rejected for the learning period while compared to the reference period (p= 0.0005),
- accepted for the first and second halves of the reference period (p=0.28).

8 CONCLUSIONS AND FUTURE WORK

Home monitoring of possible significant changes in mental state using computer games has been proposed. This approach is advantageous because it is a regular but voluntary method. Some of the problems have been analyzed, and solutions have been suggested. The system assumes voluntary participation; therefore, various games have been developed to sustain motivation in the long run. In the game battery there are both well-known, popular games and modified clinical tests; it is continuously evolving.

For change detection in cognitive performance the comparison of actual data against historical data gained from the very same person is proposed, i.e. a reference set of performance results are to be compared to the current set of results using statistical hypothesis tests. The null hypothesis is that the two sets are of the same distribution. Until the null-hypothesis cannot be rejected, the stability of the mental state can be assumed.

In the future,
- further pilots have to be launched to validate the method by more clinical tests,
- the most appropriate games for both entertainment and measurement purposes should be further investigated,
- the feasibility of multiplayer games is to be analyzed,
- collected but currently not analysed data should be involved into the examinations,
- the potential in the evaluation of the failed games should be investigated.

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

This research was performed in the Maintaining and Measuring Mental Wellness (M3W) project, supported by the AAL Joint Programme (ref. no. AAL-2009-2-109) and the Hungarian KTIA (grant no. AAL_08-1-2011-0005).

The authors gratefully acknowledge the contributions of their project partners in Greece, Luxembourg, Switzerland and Hungary. We would like to express our special thanks to
1. E. Sirály, Semmelweiss University, for her contribution to the clinical examinations with real patients using the PAL test and a selection of the M3W games;
2. N. Kiss and Á. Póczik, Budapest University of Technology and Economics, for the improvement and unification of the logging and scoring procedures;
3. L. Ketskeméty, Budapest University of Technology and Economics, for exploring and elaborating various statistical evaluation algorithms.

REFERENCES


